



Southwestern Forensic
Associates, Inc.

REVIEWER'S REPORT

DATE OF REVIEW: 07/17/08

IRO CASE #:

DESCRIPTION OF THE SERVICE OR SERVICES IN DISPUTE:

OATS procedure, left knee/ACI procedure, left knee.

DESCRIPTION OF QUALIFICATIONS OF REVIEWER:

M.D., board certified orthopedic surgeon with experience in the evaluation and treatment of patients suffering knee injuries

REVIEW OUTCOME:

“Upon independent review, I find that the previous adverse determination or determinations should be (check only one):

Upheld (Agree)

Overturned (Disagree)

Partially Overturned (Agree in part/Disagree in part)

INFORMATION PROVIDED FOR REVIEW:

1. TDI referral
2. URA findings-2-14-08 to 7-10-08
3. . Compensability dispute, 2-15-08
4. , MD, DD Report, 3-18-08
5. Evaluations, FCE, 3-18-08
6. , MD, retrospective peer review, 5-24-08
7. , DC, letter of case summary, 7/11/2008
8. , MD, office notes 10/24/07 to 5-19-08
9. , MD, surgical report, 11-15-07
10. MRI, 8-17-08

INJURED EMPLOYEE CLINICAL HISTORY (Summary):

This XX-year-old male suffered an injury to his back and left knee on XX/XX/XX. He was stepping up onto his minivan bus when he felt sharp low back pain. His left knee gave way, and he had a direct blow injury. He has had extensive evaluation of his left knee with repeated episodes of effusion treated with aspiration and Depo-Medrol and Marcaine injections. An MRI scan obtained on 08/21/07 revealed degenerative changes in the meniscii and chondromalacia, tricompartmental. On 11/15/07 he underwent left knee arthroscopy. He has been treated with activity modifications. The patient is consistently described as a morbidly obese individual at a height of 5 feet 11 inches. His weight is referred to as 300 pounds with a recent 35-pound weight loss. His BMI is calculated currently as 37. The exact request for current surgical procedure is confusing. There have been a number of treating physicians and a number of orthopedic surgeons. The request for surgical procedure has been submitted by an orthopedic surgeon, denied on more than one occasion, and the most current appeal has been provided by a chiropractor. The chiropractor requesting IRO is , D.C. The orthopedic surgeon is , M.D. There have been at least two denials. There is still confusion as to the exact procedure requested.

ANALYSIS AND EXPLANATION OF THE DECISION, INCLUDING CLINICAL BASIS, FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS USED TO SUPPORT DECISION:

It is not clear exactly what procedure has been requested. An autologous cartilage implant procedure was denied. There was a statement by the orthopedic surgeon that the requested procedure was an OATS procedure, which is an osteochondral articular implant. It is a particular system used to implant cartilage cells to defects. In either case, the criteria for either procedure are not met. Specifically at the patient's weight of 265 pounds, height 5 feet 11 inches, his BMI calculates to be 37 or more, and the specific BMI criteria stated for the OATS procedure is less than 35.

DESCRIPTION AND SOURCE OF THE SCREENING CRITERIA OR OTHER CLINICAL BASIS USED TO MAKE YOUR DECISION:

(Check any of the following that were used in the course of your review.)

- ACOEM-American College of Occupational & Environmental Medicine UM Knowledgebase.
- AHCPR-Agency for Healthcare Research & Quality Guidelines.
- DWC-Division of Workers' Compensation Policies or Guidelines.
- European Guidelines for Management of Chronic Low Back Pain.
- Interqual Criteria.
- Medical judgment, clinical experience and expertise in accordance with accepted medical standards.
- Mercy Center Consensus Conference Guidelines.
- Milliman Care Guidelines.
- ODG-Official Disability Guidelines & Treatment Guidelines
Pressley Reed, The Medical Disability Advisor.
- Texas Guidelines for Chiropractic Quality Assurance & Practice Parameters.
- Texas TACADA Guidelines.
- TMF Screening Criteria Manual.

- _____ Peer reviewed national accepted medical literature (provide a description).
- _____ Other evidence-based, scientifically valid, outcome-focused guidelines (provide a description.)