

Notice of Independent Review Decision

DATE OF REVIEW:

12/13/2007

IRO CASE #:**DESCRIPTION OF THE SERVICE OR SERVICES IN DISPUTE**

Total left knee replacement.

A DESCRIPTION OF THE QUALIFICATIONS FOR EACH PHYSICIAN OR OTHER HEALTH CARE PROVIDER WHO REVIEWED THE DECISION

Board Certified Orthopaedic Surgeon

REVIEW OUTCOME

Upon independent review the reviewer finds that the previous adverse determination/adverse determinations should be: **Upheld**

Provide a description of the review outcome that clearly states whether or not medical necessity exists for each of the health care services in dispute.

The request for left total or unicompartmental knee replacement is not medically necessary.

INFORMATION PROVIDED TO THE IRO FOR REVIEW

- MCMC: Case Report dated 12/06/07
- MCMC Referral dated 12/06/07
- DWC: Notice To MCMC, Of Case Assignment dated 12/05/07
- DWC: Notice Of Assignment Of Independent Review Organization dated 12/05/07
- DWC: Confirmation Of Receipt Of A Request For A Review dated 12/04/07
- Flahive, Ogden & Latson: Letters dated 12/10/07, 12/04/07
- LHL009: Request For A Review By An Independent Review Organization dated 11/11/07
- Reconsideration/Appeal of Adverse Determination dated 10/24/07
- M.D.: Letter dated 10/04/07
- Utilization Review Determination dated 10/03/07
- Office note dated 09/12/07
- M.D.: Release To Work dated 09/12/07
- Office note dated 08/23/07
- M.D.: Registration Form dated 08/23/07
- Questionnaire signed by claimant 08/23/07 (Has Any Blood Relative Ever Had first question)
- M.D.: Authorization To Release Medical Information dated 08/23/07
- M.D.: Consent To The Use And Disclosure Of Health Information dated 08/23/07
- M.D.: Prescription note dated 08/23/07
- Extremity Questionnaire completed by claimant on 03/23/07
- MRI & Diagnostic: MRI left knee dated 03/07/07
- MRI & Diagnostic: Operative Report dated 03/07/07 from D.O.

- Medical Center Hospital: Diagnoses/Procedures Validation dated 07/25/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Operative Report dated 07/20/06 from M.D.
- Medical Center Hospital: Discharge Summary dated 07/20/06 from M.D.
- Medical Center Hospital: History and Physical Examination dated 07/20/06 from M.D. (page 2 only)
- Outpatient Surgery form dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: History and Physical (handwritten) dated 07/20/06
- Anesthetic Evaluation dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center: Operative Record (handwritten) dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: PACU Record dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Release statement related to 07/20/06 hospitalization
- Orthopedic: Letter of Medical Necessity dated 07/20/06
- Pain Assessment Score sheet related to 07/20/06 hospitalization
- Medical Center: Progress Notes related to 07/20/06 hospitalization (pictures of knee)
- Medical Center Hospital: Anesthesia Record dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center: Discharge Status sheet dated 07/20/06
- Anesthesiology Orders dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Pre-Procedural Orders dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center: Post Operative Orders dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Medication Administration Record dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Patient Waiver dated 07/20/06
- Pre-Op Surgical Checklist For All Patients dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center: Nurses Notes dated 07/20/06
- Healthcare, Inc.: Post-Operative Patient Instructions For One Day Surgery Knee dated 07/20/06
- Orthopedics: Patient Surgery Reservation Sheet dated 07/20/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Initial Patient Assessment Record dated 07/20/06
- Healthcare, Inc.: Progress Notes dated 07/20/06 (handwritten)
- Medical Center Hospital: Discharge Planning related to 07/20/06 hospitalization
- Medical Center Hospital: Initial Nursing Assessment dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Interdisciplinary Patient/Family Education Record/Outpatient Surgery Care Plan dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Patient History dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Disclosure and Consent Medical and Surgical Procedures dated 07/19/06, 07/18/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Consent For Medical Treatment dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Lab report dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Acknowledgment of Receipt of Notice of Privacy Practices dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Patient Objection To Listing In Hospital Directory dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center Hospital: Pregnancy Statement dated 07/19/06
- Medical Center: Pre-Operative Patient Instructions For One Day Surgery dated 07/17/06
- EKG report dated 07/16/06
- Orthopedics: Patient Information sheet dated 05/31/06

- Appointment sheet for Dr. Donovan dated 05/31/06
- ODG-DWC: Undated article entitled, "Knee & Leg (Acute & Chronic)
- Medical Center Hospital: Undated Rights of Patients
- M.D.: Undated questionnaire from claimant (Were You Injured On The Job first question)
- NOTE: Carrier did not supply ODG guidelines.

PATIENT CLINICAL HISTORY [SUMMARY]:

The medical record is incomplete and composed mostly of information regarding an outpatient knee arthroscopy performed on 07/20/2006. There is little information regarding the work-related injury and initial treatment. The injured individual is a female who was reported to have sustained injury while employed as a . The mechanism of injury was slipping on water, but not falling. There is mention of an arthroscopy performed by Dr. in 04/2006, but no information or operative report for review. There is a questionable pre-injury history of a prior knee arthroscopy to this knee in the 1990's. The next record is an operative report dated 07/20/2006. M.D. performed medial and lateral partial meniscectomies, partial synovectomy/plica resection, and lateral retinacular release for patella subluxation. One of his postoperative diagnoses was villonodular synovitis. An MRI was ordered by Dr. and completed on 03/07/2007. It revealed evidence of significant osteoarthritic changes of the medial and patellofemoral compartments. There was a questionable tear of the posterior horn of the medial meniscus, but this could be consistent with post-surgical changes. The injured individual was first seen by M.D. on 08/23/2007 according to the record. He mentioned that the injured individual has undergone three knee arthroscopies in a short period of time without any improvement in her symptoms. There is a sparse history and physical. He recommended Clinoril. He noted that she had not returned to work since the injury and had been subsequently terminated. The second visit to Dr. occurred on 09/12/2007. He recommended a left Oxford unicompartmental arthroplasty. He authored a letter on 10/04/2007 in response to the denial of the procedure. He suggested that the injured individual had undergone extensive conservative measures and felt that she was a candidate for the requested surgical procedure.

ANALYSIS AND EXPLANATION OF THE DECISION INCLUDE CLINICAL BASIS, FINDINGS AND CONCLUSIONS USED TO SUPPORT THE DECISION.

The medical record reports the injured individual as being 5'5" with at least a weight of 214 pounds. She is morbidly obese and there is no mention from any of the treating physicians how this has impacted her condition. It is unclear how the mechanism of injury as described (slip without fall) has resulted in the significant arthritic findings reported currently. There is no medical documentation regarding the injured individual's initial treatment and physical findings following the injury. There is a lack of documented conservative treatment. The requested procedure does not fall within the recommendations of the **Official Disability Guidelines** as required for the State of Texas.

ODG Indications for Surgery™ -- Knee arthroplasty:

Criteria for knee joint replacement (If only 1 compartment is affected, a unicompartmental or partial replacement is indicated. If 2 of the 3 compartments are affected, a total joint replacement is indicated.):

1. Conservative Care: Medications. OR Visco supplementation injections. OR Steroid injection.
PLUS



2. Subjective Clinical Findings: Limited range of motion. OR Night-time joint pain. OR No pain relief with conservative care. PLUS

3. Objective Clinical Findings: Over 50 years of age AND Body Mass Index of less than 35. PLUS

4. Imaging Clinical Findings: Osteoarthritis on: Standing x-ray. OR Arthroscopy.

([Washington, 2003](#)) ([Sheng, 2004](#)) ([Saleh, 2002](#)) ([Callahan, 1995](#))

The injured individual is not over the age of 50 and her BMI is not less than 35. There is significant evidence that she has involvement of more than one compartment. It is unclear based upon the documentation reviewed what conservative treatment she has undergone. The medical record does not substantiate the requested procedure as medically reasonable and necessary for the work-related injury of 03/21/2006.

A DESCRIPTION AND THE SOURCE OF THE SCREENING CRITERIA OR OTHER CLINICAL BASIS USED TO MAKE THE DECISION:

ODG- OFFICIAL DISABILITY GUIDELINES & TREATMENT GUIDELINES